

TECHNICAL MEMORANDUM

US 231 Relocation Project (SR 26 To US 52) Tippecanoe County, Indiana Historic District And Rural Historic Landscape Review

The Indiana Department of Transportation (INDOT), in conjunction with the Federal Highway Administration (FHWA) is pursuing the investigation, evaluation, and documentation required by the National Environmental Policy Act (NEPA), Section 4(f) of the National Transportation Act, and Section 106 (36 CFR Part 800) of the National Historic Preservation Act (NHPA) of 1966, as amended, to review a range of alternatives for the US 231 (SR 26 to US 52), Tippecanoe County, Indiana.

The project is located in Tippecanoe County, approximately 60 miles northwest of Indianapolis, Indiana. The project encompasses portions of West Lafayette, Indiana, Purdue University campus, and unincorporated areas west of Purdue University campus, which include Wabash and Shelby Townships.

The Project Study Area (study area) is approximately 23 square miles (14, 912 acres) in size. The study area (Figure B-1) contains mixed land-uses, such as agricultural, residential, commercial, and recreational, as well as a portion of the extensive Purdue University campus. The study area's southern boundary is Baseline Road (also known as Division Road) constrained by the location of the Purdue Airport immediately to the south, as well as extensive wetlands systems and floodplain. The western boundary of the study area extends to CR 700W, just west of Montmorenci and east of the Purdue University pond area. The study area's northern boundary is existing US 52/US 231, which also serves as the northern terminus of any proposed alternative. The eastern boundary is CR 100W, constrained by the Purdue University campus and concentrated residential development.

The purpose of this review is to evaluate the potential for the Project Study Area to contain historic districts and rural historic landscapes that retain integrity and meet the minimum criteria for eligibility for listing in the National Register of Historic Places (National Register).

The study area was used as the Determination of Eligibility Survey Area (DOE Survey Area).

Historic District

A historic district is defined as " a district that possess a significant concentration, linkage, or continuity of sites, buildings, structures, or objects united historically or aesthetically by plan or physical development." A district "derives its importance from being a unified entity...which can convey a visual sense of the over-all historic environment or be an arrangement of historically or functionally related properties" (National Park Service 1991:5).

The DOE Survey Area was surveyed to determine if any areas existed that met the above definition of a historic district. Montmorenci, was identified as the only area within the DOE Survey Area that contained a concentration of resources that were 50 years of age or older. The Montmorenci area was surveyed to determine if it was eligible for the National Register as a historic district. Montmorenci contains 27 resources 50 years of age or older. Many of these

resources have been extensively altered by additions, modern porch materials, and enclosed porches on the façade or side elevations. Many of the original details and materials have been replaced or covered by modern siding materials. Of the 27 surveyed resources 50 years of age or older:

- 23 have been determined to be individually **NOT ELIGIBLE**, and
- 4 have been determined to be individually **ELIGIBLE**.

In addition, the construction of US 52, a modern four lane divided highway through the middle of Montmorenci, and the subsequent demolition of the railroad depot and the grain elevators has resulted in a loss of historic continuity to Montmorenci.

Because many of the individual resources have lost their integrity, the demolition of some original structures, the construction of US 52, and the intrusion of some modern structures, Montmorenci is not a unified entity which can convey a visual sense of its over-all historic environment and significance. Therefore, it is recommended that Montmorenci is **not an eligible historic district** due to a lack of integrity.

Rural Historic Landscape

A rural historic landscape is defined as “ a geographical area that historically has been used by people, or shaped or modified by human activity, occupancy, or intervention, and that possesses a significant concentration, linkage, or continuity of areas of land use, vegetation, buildings and structures, roads and waterways, and natural features” McClelland n.d.:1). In addition, a rural historic landscape needs be evaluated to determine whether the identified rural historic landscape meets the National Register Criteria, and retains sufficient integrity.

Landscape characteristics are the “tangible evidence of the activities and habits of the people who occupied, developed, used, and shaped the land to serve human needs; they may reflect the beliefs, attitudes, traditions, and values of these people” (McClelland n.d.:3). There are 11 characteristics of a rural historic landscape: four are processes and seven are physical components as shown in the Table 1 below.

Table 1: Characteristics of Rural Historic Landscapes	
Processes	Physical Components
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Land Uses and Activities • Patterns of Spatial Organization • Responses to the Natural Environment • Cultural Traditions 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Circulation Networks • Boundary Demarcations • Vegetation Related to Land Use • Buildings, Structures and Objects • Clusters • Archaeological Sites • Small-scale Elements

Efforts to identify rural historic landscapes included historical research and the development of a historic context statement as part of the Section 106: Phase I Survey Report (Phase I Report). Research revealed that the DOE Survey Area was primarily utilized for agricultural purposes. Early subsistence farming practices gave way to a shift to specialized farm products

and later stock farming of the mid-and late nineteenth century. As modernization of farming practices occurred late in the historic period, and predominately during the modern period, the number of farms decreased as the size of farms increased. A complete historic context statement can be found in the Phase I Report.

The DOE Survey Area was surveyed to identify any landscape characteristics and features that indicate if any areas exist that met the above defined rural historic landscape, and still retain integrity. In addition, the DOE Survey Area was surveyed to identify any areas that contain new construction and incompatible land uses, or have had the repeated loss of buildings, structures, roadway, and small-scale elements, as well as gradual changes to boundaries and land uses. A Preliminary Land Use Map (Figure B-2) shows current land use and any associated land use changes, modern residential subdivisions, and commercial developments within the DOE Survey Area. The DOE Survey Area's rural historic landscape characteristics, features, and integrity assessments are shown in Table 2.

Table 2: Rural Historic Landscape Characteristics in the DOE Survey Area

Characteristic	Features	Integrity Assessment
Land Uses and Activities	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Farming - field, pastures, orchards, farmsteads, and family cemeteries 	<p>While agricultural land use is still present within the DOE Survey Area, many of the agricultural land has been combined into larger farms, farmstead outbuildings removed, and their residence converted to single family dwellings not associated to farming. In addition, former fields, pasture land, and orchards are being excavated for use as modern residential subdivisions.</p> <p>One isolated cemetery (Spencer Cemetery, resource 157-487-20020) is located within the DOE Survey Area but its access is now blocked by modern residences.</p>
Patterns of Spatial Organization	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Grid of square mile townships and clustering 	<p>While the original rural roads that followed the township grid along the cardinal directions still exist, many new roads are being constructed within modern residential subdivisions and rural residential areas. These new roads wind and snake through the DOE Survey Area intersecting with the township roads. In addition, the township roads have been altered in the areas around the new residential developments to accommodate the additional traffic. Township roads have been widened, roadway ditches culverted and covered, and curbing added.</p> <p>The village center of Montmorenci has undergone a loss of integrity as stated above. Many of the clustered buildings in the rural area of the DOE Survey Area are now surrounded by modern buildings, residential subdivisions, and single family housing.</p> <p>Many of the farmsteads have removed outbuildings and original barns, and replaced them with modern buildings that house large pieces of modern farming equipment that meet the needs of modern farming practices.</p>
Responses to the Natural Environment	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Farmsteads located on relatively flat land outside of wetlands or bogs Field patterns around ravines and streams 	<p>Remaining farmsteads are still located on flat land. Some areas that were susceptible to seasonal flooding have been modified with modern field drainage systems to allow for these areas to be utilized for agricultural use.</p> <p>Farm fields around ravines and streams have been altered by the construction of modern residential subdivisions and single family housing. Many of these areas are now utilized by modern residential subdivisions for their aesthetic qualities and viewshed.</p>

Table 2: Rural Historic Landscape Characteristics in the DOE Survey Area

Characteristic	Features	Integrity Assessment
Cultural Traditions	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Agricultural Society buildings and rural school houses 	<p>Resource 157-333-10025 (Number 10 Grange Hall) and resource 157-333-10028 (District School No. 5) have been identified within the DOE Survey Area. Resource 157-333-10025 was determined to be individually eligible, while resource 157-333-10028 was determined to be not individually eligible.</p>
Circulation Networks	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Roads on the mile township grid running with the cardinal direction SR 26 Kankakee, Beaverville and Southern Railroad 	<p>While the original rural roads that followed the township grid along the cardinal directions still exist, many new roads are being constructed within modern residential subdivisions and rural residential areas. These new roads wind and snake through the DOE Survey Area intersecting with the township roads. In addition, the township roads have been altered in the areas around the new residential developments to accommodate the additional traffic. Township roads have been widened, roadway ditches culverted and covered, and curbing added.</p> <p>While SR 26 is still present in the DOE Survey Area, it has undergone the same types of alterations as the township roads. SR 26 has been widened and re-aligned between CR 575 W and CR 375 W.</p> <p>While the Kankakee, Beaverville and Southern Railroad right-of-way still exists and is in use, the associated buildings in Montmorenci have been demolished. Two associated railroad structures, 157-333-10021 and 157-333-10045 (barrel vault railroad overpasses) still exist but have been somewhat altered.</p>
Boundary Demarcations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Farmstead delineated by fences, tree lines, drainage ditches, roadways, and creeks/ravines 	<p>Many of the boundary lines markings have been obscured by new residential subdivisions, merging of farmstead and fields, covering of ditches, and the construction on new single family residence along creeks and ravines.</p>
Vegetation Related to Land Use	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Crops Orchards Tree lines 	<p>While the DOE Survey Area still contains some farmsteads and associated fields that are utilized for agricultural production, many fields and farmstead are being converted to large residential divisions and single family use. Tree lines are being removed and new landscaping schemes implemented. The DOE Survey Area now contains numerous scattered sites of residential subdivisions and single family dwellings.</p>
Buildings, Structures and Objects	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Farmsteads with residence, barns, silos, and outbuildings. Rural school house Agricultural society building Grain elevators Railroad buildings and structures 	<p>While the DOE Survey Area still contains some active farmsteads with associated outbuildings. many of the outbuildings have been replaced with modern outbuildings and barns. Additionally, many of the farmsteads within the DOE Survey Area have been converted to single family use and associated fields to modern residential subdivisions.</p> <p>Resource 157-333-10025 (Number 10 Grange Hall) and resource 157-333-10028 (District School No. 5) have been identified within the DOE Survey Area. Resource 157-333-10025 was determined to be individually eligible, while resource 157-333-10028 was determined to be not individually eligible.</p> <p>The grain elevators located in Montmorenci have been demolished.</p> <p>While the Kankakee, Beaverville and Southern Railroad right-of-way still exists and is in use, the associated buildings in Montmorenci have been demolished. Two associated railroad structures, 157-333-10021 and 157-333-10045 (barrel vault railroad overpasses) still exist, but have been somewhat altered.</p>

Table 2: Rural Historic Landscape Characteristics in the DOE Survey Area

Characteristic	Features	Integrity Assessment
Clusters	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Village Centers • Farmsteads • Cross-road communities 	<p>The village center of Montmorenci no longer retains its integrity because many of the individual resources have lost their integrity, the demolition of some original structures, the construction of US 52, and the intrusion of some modern structures. As such, Montmorenci is not a unified entity which can convey a visual sense of its over-all historic environment and significance.</p> <p>While the DOE Survey Area still contains some active farmsteads with associated outbuildings, many of the outbuildings have been replaced with modern outbuildings and barns. Additionally, many of the farmsteads within the DOE Survey Area have been converted to modern residential subdivisions or to single family use not associated to farming. The farmsteads that have been converted to single family use have had the outbuildings removed and associated fields combined with other fields or converted to residential subdivisions.</p> <p>While the DOE Survey Area contains some historic cross-road communities (e.g. Klondike, and the area at the intersection of West 200 North and North 400 West), these cross-road communities have been obscured by modern residential subdivisions and commercial structures and developments. Many of the remaining structures that greater than 50 years of age in these areas have lost individual integrity due to substantial alterations. Areas that historically contained agricultural fields now contain modern residential subdivisions that present a modern cross-road communities.</p>
Archaeological Sites	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Road traces • Reclaimed/reforested fields • Ruins of Farmsteads 	<p>Archaeological Site File search did not reveal any previously recorded historic archaeological sites that contained historic rural landscape features. Archaeological investigations will be performed on the Preferred Alternative at a later date.</p>
Small-scale Elements	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Road markers • Isolated rural cemeteries • Fence post and markers • Culverts • Bridges 	<p>Many of the small-scale elements that historically existed in the DOE Survey Area have been removed and are no longer present as a result modern road signs, consolidation of farmsteads and fields, and the installation of modern drainage systems.</p> <p>While isolated rural cemeteries exist in the DOE Survey Area, most have been surrounded by modern development and are no longer retain their isolated settings.</p> <p>The two previously identified bridges within the DOE Survey Area, 79-28 and 79-99 (157-333-10037) have been demolished and replaced.</p>

Rural Historic Landscape Integrity

Integrity depends to a substantial degree on the rural historic landscape's context.

“Loss or relocation of a few features usually does not affect a rural property’s overall historic integrity. But the repeated loss of buildings, structures, roadway, and small-scale elements, as well as gradual changes to boundaries and land uses, may cumulatively destroy integrity. New construction and incompatible land uses covering extensive acreage - such as residential subdivisions, modern mining or quarrying operations, refuse dumps and land fill, limited access highways and their interchanges - cause the greatest damage. Not only do they introduce major visual intrusions and interrupt the continuity of the historic scene, but they reshape the land, disturb subsurface remains, and introduce ahistorical characteristics. Large rural districts may be able to absorb new development and still maintain their overall historic integrity, provided large-scale intrusions are concentrated in a relatively few locations and cover a

proportionately small percentage of the overall acreage” (McClelland n.d. :24). “Recent changes that have erase historic characteristics, and do not have exceptional importance, make a property ineligible, even if scenic qualities are still present” (McClelland n.d. :2).

The DOE Survey Area has undergone repeated loss of buildings, structures, roadway, and small-scale elements, as well as gradual changes to boundaries and land uses, which have cumulatively destroyed the rural historic landscape integrity. New construction and incompatible land uses covering extensive acreage, such as residential subdivisions and commercial development, have also occurred in the DOE Survey Area and resulted in the interruption the continuity of the rural historic landscape, reshaped the land, and introduced modern characteristics. These recent changes have erased the historic characteristics of the rural landscape, while the remaining historic characteristic have not demonstrated exceptional importance, which has resulted in a loss of integrity.

Therefore, the DOE Survey Area does not have the potential to contain a rural historic landscape that retains integrity and meets the minimum criteria for eligibility for listing in the National Register.

Technical Memorandum: Historic District and Rural Landscape Review

Figures

Figure B-1: Project Location Map

Figure B-2: Preliminary Land Use Map

Insert Figure B-1: Project Location Map

Insert Figure B-2: Preliminary Land Use Map

References

- Keller, Timothy J. , Genevieve P. Keller, 1994, *National Register Bulletin 18, How to Evaluate and Nominate Designed Historic Landscapes*. US Department of Interior, National Park Service, Washington, D.C.
- Michael Baker Jr., Inc, 2002, US 231 Relocation Study Section 106: Phase I Survey Report, prepared for the Indiana Department of Transportation. Indianapolis, Indiana.
- McClelland, Linda Flint, J. Timothy Keller, Genevieve P. Keller, and Robert Z. Melnick, n.d., *National Register Bulletin 30, Guidelines for Evaluating and Documenting Rural Historic Landscapes*. US Department of Interior, National Park Service, Washington, D.C.
- National Park Service, 1991, *National Register Bulletin 15, How to Apply the National Register Criteria for Evaluation*. US Department of Interior, National Park Service, Washington, D.C.
- National Park Service, 1991, *National Register Bulletin 16A, How to Complete the National Register Form*. US Department of Interior, National Park Service, Washington, D.C.
- Seifert, Donna J., 1991, *National Register Bulletin 21, Defining Boundaries for National Register Properties*. US Department of Interior, National Park Service, Washington, D.C.